

THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY  
OF VICTORIA

1946 - 1953

MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY OF VICTORIA VOL. 1  
W. C. C.

**Michael G R Gronow  
Barrister - at - Law  
205 William St Melbourne  
Tel: (03) 9225 7115**

# THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY OF VICTORIA

During the Years  
1946 to 1953

*Edited by*

G. H. LUSH, LL.B.  
BARRISTER-AT-LAW

*and*

KENNETH J. GRICE  
M.D., M.R.C.P., F.R.A.C.P.

Vol. V

1953  
BROWN, PRIOR, ANDERSON Pty. Ltd.  
MELBOURNE

	PAGE
Some Aspects of the Problem of Mental Hygiene in Victoria. By A. J. M. Sinclair, M.D., F.R.C.P., F.R.A.C.P.	170
Workers' Compensation. By John Kennedy, M.D., F.R.C.S., F.R.A.C.S., and George H. Lush, Barrister-at-Law	185
Medico-Legal Blood Group Tests. By Lucy M. Bryce, C.B.E., B.Sc., M.B., B.S., F.R.A.C.P.	202
Civil Liability Arising Out of Hospital Treatment. By The Honourable Sir Charles J. Lowe, Senior Puisne Justice of the Supreme Court of Victoria	220
Are Surgeons Charitable? By P. D. Phillips, Q.C., Bar- rister-at-Law	230
The Doctor as an Expert Witness. By Professor E. S. J. King, M.D., M.S., D.Sc., F.R.C.S., F.R.A.C.S., F.R.A.C.P., and F. R. Nelson, Q.C., Barrister-at-Law	252
The Stewart MacArthur Prize Essay for 1948 — The Con- trol of Patent Medicines. By Norma O'Connor	272
List of Members	297

OFFICE-BEARERS

1952-1953

President: Mr. Justice Dean

Vice-Presidents: Dr. Clive Fitts, Mr. P. D. Phillips, q.c.

Honorary Treasurer: Dr. Guy Springthorpe

Honorary Secretaries and Editors:

Mr. G. H. Lush, Dr. Kenneth J. Grice

Committee: Messrs. J. B. Tait, q.c., R. V. Monahan, q.c.,  
D. I. Menzies, q.c., J. G. Norris, q.c.,  
R. N. Vroland, Wilfred Hall;

Doctors John F. Williams, John Hayden, W. E.  
King, Leslie Hurley, Gerald Weigall.

## FOREWORD

This fifth volume of the proceedings of the Medico-Legal Society of Victoria makes its appearance some eleven years after its immediate predecessor. At a meeting of the Society's Committee held on 27th February, 1942, it was decided that the Society should go into recess for the duration of the war, and members were immediately informed of this resolution by circular letter. At the same Committee meeting it was resolved that the existing office-bearers of the Society should continue to hold office until the Society resumed its activities.

The Committee which continued in office under this last resolution was convened again on 23rd November, 1945, when it was resolved that the Society should resume its activities and should again hold its customary meetings. It is proper to record that the Committee which held office at the suspension of activities in 1942 and at their resumption in 1945 was constituted by the following members:

President: Dr. L. S. Latham.

Vice-Presidents: Judge A. W. Foster, Dr. S. O. Cowen.

Committee: Messrs. E. G. Coppel; Arthur Dean, W. Slater, M.L.A., W. O. Burt, R. Vroland; Drs. W. D. Upjohn, John Kennedy, Leo Doyle, Tennyson Allen, John F. Williams.

Treasurer: Dr. Guy Springthorpe.

Honorary Secretaries and Editors: Mr. J. V. Barry and Dr. R. J. Wright-Smith.

The first meeting of the Society after the resumption was held on 21st February, 1946, at the British Medical Society Hall, when Dr. A. E. Coates delivered an address entitled "A Prisoner of the Japanese". Since that date the Society has continued to hold its usual general meetings at which addresses are delivered and discussed, and in 1947 resumed holding its annual dinner.

Space does not allow the Editors to set out in full the names of the members of the Committee from 1946 to 1952. The following gentlemen held office during that period as Presidents of the Society:

1946-47 Judge A. W. Foster

1947-48 Mr. Victor Hurley

1948-49 Mr. Justice Barry

1949-50 Mr. Leo Doyle  
1950-51 Mr. Justice Coppel  
1951-52 Dr. John Kennedy

Mr. D. I. Menzies served the Society as legal secretary from 1946 to 1952. During that period Dr. John Hayden was medical secretary until 1949, when he was succeeded in that office by Dr. Kenneth J. Grice. Dr. Guy Springthorpe has continued to act as treasurer since the inception of the Society in 1931.

The present office-bearers of the Society are set out on page vii of this volume.

The addresses which are included in this volume represent the Society's endeavour to take up again its function of providing a forum for the informed discussion of matters which have a public importance and in which the members of our two professions, by virtue of their special trainings, can provide enlightenment.

G. H. LUSH  
KENNETH J. GRICE  
Honorary Editors.

Melbourne, May 1953.

## EDITORS' NOTE

In addition to the addresses contained in this volume, the following addresses were also delivered to general meetings of the Society in the years covered by this volume of proceedings:

- (i) Design of Professional Courses for Law and Medicine, by Professor G. W. Paton and Professor R. D. Wright, delivered on 17th August, 1946.
- (ii) Medicine in the Law and the Law in Medicine, by the same gentlemen, delivered on 12th April, 1947.
- (iii) Sudden Death, by Dr. Leo Doyle, delivered on 20th March, 1948.
- (iv) Post-mortem Blood Alcohol Estimation and its Medico-legal Implications, by Dr. K. Bowden, delivered on 20th November, 1948.
- (v) Experiences of Heart Disease and Workers' Compensation, by Dr. Clive Fitts, delivered on 26th November, 1949.
- (vi) Leucotomy, by Mr. Justice Sholl and Dr. John Adey, delivered on 22nd April, 1950.
- (vii) Medico-Legal Aspects of Blood Grouping, by Mr. Justice Barry, delivered on 3rd November, 1951.

The paper by Mr. R. V. Monahan, Q.C., on Sudden Death which is included in this volume was a companion paper to that written by Dr. Leo Doyle. Similarly, the paper on Medico-Legal Aspects of Blood Grouping, by Dr. Lucy Bryce, was a companion paper to that by Mr. Justice Barry.

The Editors regret that it is impossible to present a complete record of the proceedings. The papers listed above are not available now for a variety of reasons, and to attempt to reconstruct them would impose an unreasonable burden on their authors. In the case of the papers by Professors Paton and Wright, your Editors considered that the group was so inter-related that it was inadvisable to publish some without the others, and as Professor Paton's papers were not available, your Editors, with the approval of your Committee, decided to omit the whole group.

In past volumes of the proceedings there has been published a record of the discussion which followed upon the papers read to the Society. After the war a shorthand note of the discussion



was taken at a few meetings, but it then became impossible to obtain the services of shorthand writers. As a result no record of discussions exists from the year 1948 onwards. As this volume covers seven years of the Society's proceedings, the need for keeping it down to a reasonable size has lead to the exclusion of the few notes of discussion which exist. The Society hopes to resume the practice of recording and publishing discussion in the next volume.

The present volume contains, in addition to papers delivered to the Society, an essay on "The Control of Patent Medicines" by Miss Norma O'Connor. This essay was, in 1948, awarded the Stewart MacArthur Prize, a prize offered by this Society as a memorial to its first President.

This volume also contains two papers delivered in 1941 after the last volume went to press. These are the papers on Functional Disorders and Workers' Compensation Legislation, delivered on 27th September, 1941, by Dr. Ralph McMeekin, and Pride and Prejudice, delivered on 15th November, 1941, by Dr. C. H. Fitts. Despite the inclusion of these papers the Editors have thought it desirable to describe the present volume as the Proceedings from 1946 to 1952.

The Editors desire to express their thanks to Mr. W. E. Paterson of the Melbourne Bar, without whose industrious assistance this volume might never have seen the light of day.

Melbourne, May 1953.