

THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY  
OF VICTORIA

1953 - 1954

VOL. VI

VICTORIA

SOCIETY OF

MEDICO-LEGAL

W.C.

**Michael G R Gronow**  
**Barrister - at - Law**  
**205 William St Melbourne**  
**Tel: (03) 9225 7115**

THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY  
OF VICTORIA

1953-1954

# THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY OF VICTORIA

During the Years  
1953 to 1954

*Edited by*

G. H. LUSH, LL.B.  
BARRISTER-AT-LAW

*and*

KENNETH J. GRICE  
M.D., M.R.C.P., F.R.A.C.P.

Vol. VI

1955  
BROWN, PRIOR, ANDERSON Pty. Ltd.  
MELBOURNE

For circulation among the members of the Medico-Legal Society  
of Victoria

Impression limited to 500 copies

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

*Wholly set up and printed in Australia  
by Brown, Prior, Anderson Pty. Ltd.,  
430 Little Bourke St., Melbourne, C.1, 1955*

## CONTENTS

	PAGE
Office bearers .. .. .	vii
Foreword .. .. .	ix
Editors' Note .. .. .	xi
Are Modern Awards for Damages for Physical Injuries Becoming Excessive? By Oliver J. Gillard, Q.C. ..	1
Sudden Death in Abortion. By R. Donald Teare, M.D., M.R.C.P. .. .. .	21
Suicide. By E. Cunningham Dax, M.B., B.S., B.Sc., D.P.M. (R.C.P. et S.), L.M.S.S.A. (London), Chairman of the Men- tal Hygiene Authority .. .. .	46
Physical Effort and Coronary Occlusion. By E. S. J. King, M.D., M.S., D.Sc., F.R.C.S., F.R.A.C.S., F.R.A.C.P. .. ..	55
Life and the Law in Matrimonial Causes. By E. H. E. Barber of the Victorian Bar .. .. .	74
Partnership as a Form of Professional Organization. By Professor F. P. Donovan, LL.B. (Queensland), B.A. (Oxon), B.C.L. (Oxon), LL.B. (Adelaide), LL.M. .. ..	93
Lines of Communication. By Dr. C. H. Fitts .. .. .	123
The Symptomatic Alcoholic. By Stanley Johnston, B.A., LL.B. .. .. .	152
List of Members .. .. .	185

OFFICE-BEARERS

1953-1954

President: Mr. P. D. Phillips, q.c.

Vice Presidents: Dr. John Hayden, Mr. D. I. Menzies, q.c.

Honorary Treasurer: Dr. Guy Springthorpe

Honorary Secretaries and Editors:

Mr. G. H. Lush, Dr. Kenneth J. Grice

Committee: Messrs. R. V. Monahan, q.c., J. G. Norris, q.c.,  
R. A. Smithers, q.c., Wilfred Hall.

Doctors John F. Williams, W. E. King, Leslie  
Hurley, Gerald Weigall.

## FOREWORD

This is the sixth volume of the Proceedings of the Medico-Legal Society in Victoria. It includes seven papers which were delivered at general meetings of the Society in the years 1953 and 1954 and an essay entitled "The Symptomatic Alcoholic" by Mr. Stanley Johnston, B.A., LL.B., which was awarded the Stewart Macarthur prize in 1953.

The committees which have controlled the destinies of the Society in the years covered by this volume were as follows:—

1952-53	President . . . .	Mr. Justice Dean
	Vice-Presidents	
	Medical . . . .	Dr. Clive Fitts
	Legal . . . .	Mr. P. D. Phillips, q.c.
	Hon. Treasurer .	Dr. Guy Springthorpe
	Hon. Secretaries .	Dr. Kenneth J. Grice Mr. G. H. Lush
	Committee . . . .	Drs. John F. Williams, John Hayden, W. E. King, Leslie Hurley, Gerald Weigall. Messrs. J. B. Tait, q.c., R. V. Monahan, q.c., D. I. Menzies, q.c., J. G. Norris, q.c., R. N. Vroland and Wilfred Hall.
	Hon. Audidtor . .	Mr. A. P. Webb
1953-54	President . . . .	Dr. Clive Fitts
	Vice-Presidents	
	Medical . . . .	Dr. John Hayden
	Legal . . . .	Mr. P. D. Phillips, q.c.
	Hon. Treasurer .	Dr. Guy Springthorpe
	Hon. Secretaries .	Dr. Kenneth J. Grice Mr. G. H. Lush
	Committee . . . .	Drs. John F. Williams, W. E. King, Leslie Hurley, Gerald Weigall

Messrs. J. B. Tait, q.c., R. V.  
Monahan, q.c., D. I. Menzies,  
q.c., J. G. Norris, q.c., R. A.  
Smithers, q.c., and Wilfred  
Hall

Hon. Auditor . . . Mr. A. P. Webb

G. H. LUSH  
KENNETH J. GRICE  
Honorary Editors

Melbourne, August 1955

## EDITORS' NOTE

This volume contains not only the papers delivered to the Society in the period which it covers but also a summary of the discussions which followed the reading of the papers. The Committee of the Society decided in 1954 to resume the practice of making a shorthand record of the discussions, and further decided that this volume should contain not the whole of the transcript of the discussion but a summary of it.

It will be noted that no discussion is recorded in the cases of the paper delivered by Mr. O. J. Gillard, q.c., and Dr. Cunningham Dax. Mr. Gillard's paper was delivered before the practice of taking a shorthand note was resumed, and on the night when Dr. Cunningham Dax delivered his paper there were in fact no shorthand writers present.

Readers will understand that if in the summaries of discussion inaccurate or unwise remarks are attributed to any of the speakers, the fault lies with the editors who have prepared the summary and not with the original speaker. To the speakers whose sage utterances have been thus mutilated, the editors offer their apologies.

The editors desire to express their thanks to Mr. W. E. Paterson of the Melbourne Bar for his assistance in attending to the printing of this volume.

Melbourne, August 1955.

THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY  
OF VICTORIA

1955-1956

MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY OF VICTORIA VOL. VII

Michael G R Gronow  
Barrister - at - Law  
205 William St Melbourne  
Tel: (03) 9225 7115  
**LIBRARY BOOK**

THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY  
OF VICTORIA

1955 - 1956

KN 185 MED  
ID: 439

MOLOMBY & MOLON  
SOLICITORS  
575 BOURKE ST.,  
MELBOURNE  
LIBRARY BOOK

# THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY OF VICTORIA

During the Years  
1955 to 1956

*Edited by*

G. H. LUSH, LL.B.  
BARRISTER-AT-LAW

*and*

KENNETH J. GRICE  
M.D., M.R.C.P., F.R.A.C.P.

Vol. VII

1957

BROWN, PRIOR, ANDERSON Pty. Ltd.  
MELBOURNE

For circulation among the members of the  
Medico-Legal Society of Victoria

Impression limited to 500 copies

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

*Wholly set up and printed in Australia  
by Brown, Prior, Anderson Pty. Ltd.,  
430 Little Bourke St., Melbourne, C.1, 1957*

## CONTENTS

	PAGE
Office-bearers .. .. .	vii
Foreword .. .. .	ix
Professional Privilege, or Can't You Keep a Secret. By Mr. R. A. Smithers, Q.C. .. .. .	1
The Mental Content of Negligence. By Judge J. G. Norris	22
Professional People. By Dr. G. R. Weigall and Mr. D. I. Menzies, Q.C. .. .. .	38
Medicine and the Law in India. By Sir Lionel Horwill ..	62
Capital Punishment. By Dr. J. K. Adey .. .. .	83
Law Enforcement in the United States of America. By Mr. Justice J. V. Barry .. .. .	97
Truth Drugs. By Dr. A. D. Meares .. .. .	137
The Legal Profession. By Professor Maurice Ewing ..	152
List of Members .. .. .	159



## OFFICE-BEARERS

*1955-1956*

President: Dr. Guy Springthorpe

Vice-Presidents: Dr. John Hayden, Mr. D. I. Menzies, Q.C.

Honorary Treasurer: Mr. J. McL. Young

Honorary Secretaries and Editors:

Mr. G. H. Lush, Dr. Kenneth J. Grice

Committee: Judge J. G. Norris, Messrs. R. A. Smithers, Q.C.,  
Wilfred Hall, Professor D. P. Derham

Doctors J. F. Williams, W. E. King, Leslie Hurley,  
G. Raleigh Weigall, Professor E. S. J. King

*1956-1957*

President: Mr. D. I. Menzies, Q.C.

Vice-Presidents: Dr. John Hayden, Judge J. G. Norris

Honorary Treasurer: Mr. J. McL. Young

Honorary Secretaries and Editors:

Mr. G. H. Lush, Dr. Kenneth J. Grice

Committee: Messrs. R. A. Smithers, Q.C., Wilfred Hall,  
Professor D. P. Derham

Doctors J. F. Williams, W. E. King, Leslie Hurley,  
G. Raleigh Weigall, Professor E. S. J. King

## FOREWORD

During the years 1955 and 1956, eight papers were delivered at General Meetings of the Medico-Legal Society of Victoria, and seven of these papers are presented in this, the Seventh Volume of the Proceedings of that Society.

The eighth paper was a paper entitled "The Natural or The Foster Mother", which was read by Dr. Alan C. Jeffrey, M.B., B.S., B.Sc., on 19th November, 1955. Unfortunately this paper is not available for publication.

Preparation of an index of the contents of this volume and of the six preceding volumes has been begun, and the Editors had hoped to publish the index as part of this volume. However, the preparation involved an unforeseen amount of work and the publication of the index has had to be deferred.

The practice, which was resumed in Volume VI, of publishing a summary of the discussion following the papers delivered at General Meetings has been continued in this volume and again the Editors accept responsibility for inaccuracies or distortions in the summaries.

At the Annual Dinner of the Society held on 28th July, 1956, the toast of the Legal Profession was proposed by Professor Maurice Ewing, Professor of Surgery at the University of Melbourne. The text of his speech is included in this Volume.

Mr. W. E. Paterson of the Melbourne Bar has again offered to attend to the printing of this volume and the Editors express their thanks to him.

G. H. LUSH  
KENNETH J. GRICE } Hon. Editors

*Melbourne*  
*November, 1957*