

MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY OF VICTORIA

VOL. XVI

THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY  
OF VICTORIA

1994-2002

**Michael G R Gronow  
Barrister - at - Law  
205 William St Melbourne  
Tel: (03) 9225 7115**

Michael Cronow.

THE PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY  
OF VICTORIA

During the Years  
1994-2002

*Edited by*  
DR. GABRIELE MEDLEY  
*and*  
MR. RUSSELL BALL

Vol. XVI

PRINTED BY BPA PRINT GROUP

## FOREWORD

This Volume brings publication of the proceedings of the Medico-Legal Society of Victoria up to date as at the end of 2002.

Some of the papers have been edited to take into account the use of visual tools such as slides and graphs. For the first time questions and answers have been included when they add to an understanding of the topic. We have endeavoured to identify the questioner and apologise if we are in error.

We acknowledge and are most grateful for the considerable assistance provided by Michelle Ball who spent many hours editing the addresses.

GABRIELE MEDLEY

RUSSELL BALL

*Honorary editors*

## CONTENTS

	PAGE
Office-Bearers	xi
<i>Concepts of Liability – Female Genital Mutilation And Negligent Barristers</i>	1
Mr Julian Burnside QC An address delivered on 28 May 1994.	
<i>Where Should We Let Molecular Genetics Take Us?</i>	29
Professor David Danks An address delivered on 20 August 1994.	
<i>Matters of Living and Dying – Some Ethical Considerations</i>	55
Dr. Davis McCaughey An address delivered on 25 March 1995.	
<i>Just Another Smear Campaign</i>	69
Dr. Gabriele Medley An address delivered on 12 August 1995.	
<i>The Relationship Between Stress and Cancer</i>	79
Professor Gabriel Kune An address delivered on 13 May 1995.	
<i>The Paranoia of Pioneer Anaesthetists</i>	95
Dr. Tony Atkinson An address delivered on 13 April 1996.	
<i>The Impaired Physician</i>	105
Dr. Tony Weeks An address delivered on 18 May 1996.	
<i>Repressed Memory Evidence in Sexual Cases – A Legal Perspective</i>	123
Mr. David Grace QC An address delivered on 21 March 1997.	

<i>Medical Records - Doctor's or Patient's?</i>	141
Mr. David Curtain QC	
An address delivered on 9 May 1997.	
<i>The Impaired and Poorly Performing Medical Practitioner and the Medical Board</i>	153
Dr. Kerry Breen and Dr. Chanah Wijesinghe	
An address delivered on 9 August 1997.	
<i>The Provision of Medical Services in an Anarchy</i>	169
Ms. Phoebe Wynne-Pope and Senator John Herron	
An address delivered on 11 October 1997.	
<i>Cults and Sects</i>	189
Dr. Louise Samway	
An address delivered on 27 March 1998.	
<i>Bringing Them Home</i>	213
Sir Ronald Wilson and The Honourable Justice Murray Kellam	
An address delivered on 9 May 1998.	
<i>Remote Obstetric and Gynaecological Services to Indigenous Communities</i>	233
Professor Michael Humphrey	
An address delivered on 22 August 1998.	
<i>Drugs in Sport</i>	249
Dr. Peter A. Larkins	
An address delivered on 9 October 1998.	
<i>The Whistle-Blower in Medicine</i>	271
Dr. Stephen Bolsin	
An address delivered on 19 March 1999.	
<i>Reproductive Technology- Who Owns What?</i>	289
Dr. John McBain and Mr. Jack Forrest QC	
An address delivered on 7 May 1999.	

<i>Crisis Management of the Siege/Hostage Situation</i> Senior Sergeant Michael Andrews and Ms. Megan Fulford An address delivered on 13 August 1999.	307
<i>The Liability of Adolescents for Criminal Behaviour</i> Professor Michael Carr Gregg and Mr. Robert Richter QC An address delivered on 9 October 1999.	327
<i>Telling Lies For God</i> Professor Ian Plimer An address delivered on 13 November 1999.	351
<i>The History of Plastic Surgery - The Australasian Connection</i> Professor Wayne Morrison An address delivered on 4 March 2000.	373
<i>How the Law Abets Medicine in Promoting Pseudo-Illness: Post Traumatic Stress Disorder</i> Dr. David Bell An address delivered on 5 May 2000.	389
<i>Sex and the Medical Profession</i> Professor John Ellard A paper delivered on 12 August 2000.	413
<i>The Work of Medecins Sans Frontieres</i> Dr. Rob Moodie An address delivered on 6 October 2000.	429
<i>Olympic Champions</i> Mr. Herb Elliott An address delivered on 11 November 2000.	445
<i>The Genetic Modification of Food</i> Professor Nancy Millis An address delivered on 2 March 2001.	463

<i>Death, Disaster and Destruction</i> Professor John Clement and Professor David Ranson An address delivered on 12 May 2001.	483
<i>Depression – A Medical and Legal Problem</i> Professor Graham D. Burrows and The Honourable Justice Frank Vincent An address delivered on 1 September 2001.	501
<i>Medicine at the Extreme</i> Professor Jeffrey Rosenfeld An address delivered on 12 October 2001.	521
<i>The Royal Flying Doctor Service</i> Mr. Michael Long An address delivered on 17 November 2001.	539
<i>No Fault Personal Injury Compensation. What Can We Learn From New Zealand?</i> Dr. Denys Court An address delivered on 1 March 2002.	555
<i>Stem Cells</i> Professor Alan Trounson and Dr. Rufus Black An address delivered on 4 May 2002.	579
<i>Australia's Refugee Policy: Hypocrisy and Human Rights</i> Mr. Julian Burnside Q.C. An address delivered on 30 August 2002.	607
<i>Body Dysmorphic Disorder and the Implications for Plastic Surgery</i> Mr. Bryan Mendelson and Professor David Castle An address delivered on 12 October 2002.	631
<i>The Civil Jury System – An Appropriate Method of Trial?</i> The Honourable Justice Howard Nathan and Mr. Ross Gillies QC An address delivered on 16 November 2002.	653



<i>Does a doctor have a duty to provide information and advice about complementary and alternative medicine?</i>	671
Ms. Elizabeth Brophy	
Ms. Brophy was awarded the Medico-Legal Society Prize 2002 for this paper.	
<i>Members List</i>	693

OFFICE BEARERS  
OF THE  
MEDICO-LEGAL SOCIETY OF VICTORIA

1995-1996

*President:* Mr. David Brownbill  
*Vice President(Medical):* Dr. William Wilson  
*Vice President (Legal):* Mr. John Ball  
*Hon. Treasurer:* Mr. Geoffrey Gronow  
*Hon. Secretary (Medical):* Dr. John Silver  
*Hon. Secretary (Legal):* His Honour Judge Murray Kellam  
*Committee:* Dr. John Marum, Dr. Max Haverfield, Dr. Paul Nisselle,  
Dr. Gabriele Medley, Dr. Robert Nave, Miss J.R. Ross, Mr. Julian  
Burnside Q.C., Judge Stuart Murdoch, Mr. D. Curtain Q.C.,  
Mr. David Wells.

1996-1997

*President:* Mr. David Wells  
*Vice President:* His Honour Judge Stuart Murdoch  
*Hon. Treasurer:* Mr. Geoffrey Gronow  
*Hon. Secretary (Medical):* Dr. John Silver  
*Hon. Secretary (Legal):* His Honour Judge Murray Kellam  
*Committee:* Dr. John Marum, Dr. Max Haverfield, Dr. Paul Nisselle,  
Dr. Gabriele Medley, Dr. Robert Nave, Mr. D. Curtain Q.C.,  
Her Honour Judge Elizabeth Curtain, Mr. Russell Ball,  
Ms. Pauline Shiff.

1997-1998

*President:* Mr. William Wilson  
*Vice President:* His Honour Judge Murray Kellam  
*Hon. Treasurer:* Mr. Geoffrey Gronow  
*Hon. Secretary (Medical):* Dr. John Silver  
*Hon. Secretary (Legal):* Mr. Russell Ball  
*Committee:* Dr. Robert Nave, Dr. Max Haverfield, Dr. Paul Nisselle,  
Dr. Gabriele Medley, Mr. David Curtain Q.C., Her Honour Judge  
Elizabeth Curtain, Ms. Pauline Shiff, Mrs. Mary Anne Hartley.

1998-1999

*President:* The Honourable Justice Murray Kellam  
*Vice President (Medical):* Dr. John Silver  
*Vice President (Legal):* Mr. David Curtain Q.C.  
*Hon. Treasurer:* Mr. Geoffrey Gronow  
*Hon. Secretary (Medical):* Dr. Gabriele Medley  
*Hon. Secretary (Legal):* Mr. Russell Ball  
*Committee:* Dr. John Marum, Dr. Robert Nave, Dr. Max Haverfield,  
Dr. Paul Nisselle, Mr. David Webb, Her Honour Judge Elizabeth  
Curtain, Ms. Pauline Shiff, Mrs. Mary Anne Hartley, Mr. Paul  
Scanlon,  
Mr. Michael Wheelahan.

1999-2000

*President:* Dr. John Silver  
*Vice President (Medical):* Dr. John Marum  
*Vice President (Legal):* Mr. David Curtain Q.C.  
*Hon. Treasurer:* Mr. Geoffrey Gronow  
*Hon. Secretary (Medical):* Dr. Gabriele Medley  
*Hon. Secretary (Legal):* Mr. Russell Ball  
*Committee:* Dr. Robert Nave, Dr. Max Haverfield, Dr. Paul Nisselle,  
Mr. David Webb, Dr. Jane Tovey, Her Honour Judge Elizabeth Curtain,  
Ms. Pauline Shiff, Mrs. Mary Anne Hartley, Mr. Paul Scanlon,  
Mr. Michael Wheelahan.

2000-2001

*President:* Mr. David Curtain Q.C.  
*Vice President (Medical):* Dr. John Marum  
*Vice President (Legal):* Ms. Pauline Shiff  
*Hon. Treasurer:* Mr. Geoffrey Gronow  
*Hon. Secretary (Medical):* Dr. Gabriele Medley  
*Hon. Secretary (Legal):* Mr. Russell Ball  
*Committee:* Dr. Max Haverfield, Dr. Robert Nave, Dr. Paul Nisselle,  
Mr. David Webb, Dr. Michael Hurley, Her Honour Judge Elizabeth  
Curtain, Mrs. Mary Anne Hartley, Mr. Michael Wheelahan,  
Mr. John Middleton Q.C., Mr. Paul Scanlon Q.C.

2001-2002

*President:* Dr. John Marum

*Vice President (Medical):* Dr. Max Haverfield

*Vice President (Legal):* Ms. Pauline Shiff

*Hon. Treasurer:* Mr. Geoffrey Gronow

*Hon. Secretary (Medical):* Dr. Gabriele Medley

*Hon. Secretary (Legal):* Mr. Russell Ball

*Committee:* Dr. Robert Nave, Dr. Paul Nisselle, Mr. David Webb, Dr. Michael Hurley, Dr. Terry Little, Her Honour Judge Elizabeth Curtain, Mrs. Mary Anne Hartley, Mr. Michael Wheelahan, Mr. John Middleton Q.C., Mr. Stephen Moloney.